

**Board of Pilot Commissioners for Harris County Ports
Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee
Advisory Subcommittee Meeting**

July 14, 2014

A meeting of the Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Advisory Subcommittee (the "PBIRC") was convened on Monday, July 14, 2014 at 14:00, at the Port of Houston Authority Executive Offices, Fourth Floor Executive Conference room, at 111 East Loop North, Houston, Texas 77029. The following members and staff were present:

Captain Marcus Woodring, Chairman
Paul Caruselle
Captain David Foret
Captain Michael Morris
Captain Richard Russell
Captain Mike Usher, Pilot Board Compliance Coordinator

Chairman Woodring called the meeting of the PBIRC to order and introduced Captain Richard Russell as new member to the PBIRC, and the committee members provided Captain Russell guidance as to the role of the PBIRC and sub-committee.

A. M/T HELLAS NAUTILUS grounding at Targa Terminal HSC December 17, 2013.

1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "A" attached.
2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Barton.
3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

Discussion centered on mechanical failure of rudder and results of dive survey following incident which showed rudder stock to be twisted.

Captain Morris suggested that the Lonestar Harbor Safety Committee recommend to Targa that ships moored at Targa Terminal Dock 5 be moored starboard side to, to prevent need to back a ship out with stern in towards south shoaling bank.

Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. The motion was brought by Mr. Caruselle, seconded by Captain Foret. Chairman Woodring, Captain Morris and Captain Russell voted Aye. Nays none.

B. M/V GENIUS STAR VII collision with Kirby barge 27720 being pushed by UTV GARY REED IVO HSC Lt. 31/32 March 14, 2014.

1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "B" attached.
2. Proposed Recommendations: That matter warrants a full hearing before the entire PBIRC.

July 14, 2014

Several facets of this incident were discussed. M/V STOLT INNOVATION preceded the M/V GENIUS STAR VII inbound and potentially was the cause of the Kirby barge breaking loose prior to being struck by the M/V GENIUS STAR VII. A full hearing is recommended to further explore the circumstances and actions of the Pilots involved.

Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend a full hearing before the entire PBIRC. The motion was brought by Mr. Caruselle, seconded by Captain Russell. Chairman Woodring, Captain Morris and Captain Foret voted Aye. Nays none.

C. M/V SUMMER WIND collision with Kirby barge 27706 being pushed by UTV MISS SUSAN IVO HSC Lt. 25/26 March 22, 2014.

1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "C" attached.
2. Proposed Recommendations: That matter warrants a full hearing before the entire PBIRC.

There are many factors involved in this incident as indicated by the U.S. Coast Guard and NTSB hearings/investigations being conducted concurrently. A full hearing is recommended to further explore the circumstances and actions of the Pilots involved.

Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend a full hearing before the entire PBIRC. The motion was brought by Mr. Caruselle, seconded by Chairman Woodring. Captain Morris, Captain Foret and Captain Russell voted Aye. Nays none.

D. M/V BEKS CENK allision with 6-10 Bridge HSC May 13, 2014.

1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "D" attached.
2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Arbogast.
3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

A post incident investigation by the U.S. Coast Guard revealed that the ship dimensions (height of mast) were incorrect by 3 meters, causing the allision to occur.

July 14, 2014

Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. The motion was brought by Mr. Caruselle, seconded by Captain Morris. Chairman Woodring, Captain Foret and Captain Russell voted Aye. Nays none.

E. M/V CHIPOLBROK GALEX surge line incident HSC May 22, 2014.

1. Statement of Capt. Arthur Tuttle: See Exhibit "E" attached.
2. Captain Tuttle submitted a pilot statement but no other reports of this incident were received. Because of his submission, sub-committee discussed the incident.
3. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Tuttle.
4. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

Chairman Woodring recommended that this incident be referred to the Lonestar Harbor Safety Committee, specifically their "slack line" team.

F. Captain Morris explained a near miss incident that occurred earlier this year involving an inbound ship piloted by Captain Picton and a towing vessel in the vicinity of the Bayport Ship Channel. Captain Morris announced that he would like to share the incident with the Pilot Board at a scheduled meeting.

Meeting adjourned.

Exhibit A
Incident Summary

Title: M/T HELLAS NAUTILUS grounding departing Targa Terminal HSC December 17, 2013.

Summary of Investigation:

U.S. Coast Guard Sector Houston-Galveston opened a marine casualty investigation into this matter.

The Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee (“PBIRC”) was designated a party in interest as defined in 46 United States Code (USC) § 6303 and Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 4.03-10.

The PBIRC Compliance Coordinator attended marine casualty site assessment, and witness interviews.

The following information was gathered by the PBIRC Compliance Coordinator from U. S. Coast Guard records, witness statements and interviews.

Summary of Facts:

1. December 17, 2013 Houston Branch Pilot’s Captain Kent Barton and Captain Elton Porter boarded the M/T HELLAS NAUTILUS at Targa Terminal Dock 5 for a two pilot outbound transit to sea.
2. After master pilot exchange, vessel and crew were ready for intended transit.
3. Captain Barton at the conn backed the vessel’s stern to port departing from Targa Terminal Dock 5.
4. After the vessel shaped up and stood out in the channel, Captain Barton came starboard ahead to begin intended transit.
5. Within 15 minutes of transit a steering casualty had been reported.
6. The steering was stuck 20° starboard.
7. It was decided that the vessel should suspend the transit and moor at the first available lay berth.
8. The vessel was moored at Shell Dock HSC without incident and pilots disembarked.
9. The situation was reported to VTS.
10. There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Exhibit B
Incident Summary

Title: M/V GENIUS STAR VII collision with Kirby barge 27720 being pushed by UTV GARY REED IVO HSC Lt. 31/32.

Summary of Investigation:

U.S. Coast Guard Marine Safety Unit (“MSU”) Texas City opened a marine casualty investigation into this matter.

The Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee (“PBIRC”) was designated a party in interest as defined in 46 United States Code (USC) § 6303 and Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 4.03-10.

The PBIRC Compliance Coordinator attended marine casualty site assessment, and witness interviews.

The following information was gathered by the PBIRC Compliance Coordinator from U. S. Coast Guard records, witness statements and interviews.

Summary of Facts:

1. March 14, 2014, Houston Branch Pilot Captain Holly Cooper boarded the M/V GENIUS STAR VII at Jacinto Port 3 for an outbound transit to sea.
2. After master pilot exchange, vessel and crew were ready for intended transit.
3. Area conditions were cloudy with gentle breeze and very smooth sea. Visibility was good.
4. Outbound transit was uneventful.
5. As the GENIUS STAR VII approached the area between beacons 31/32 – 33/34, Captain Cooper entered into a one whistle passing agreement with the UTV GARY REED that was strung out with two tows inbound in the alternate route traffic lane approaching HSC and also with the inbound tanker STOLT INNOVATION piloted by Houston Branch Pilot Captain Michael Phillips.
6. The meeting and passing arrangement with the STOLT INNOVATION in vicinity of beacons 27/28 was the first to take place and it went without incident.
7. Immediately following the STOLT INNOVATION passing arrangement, the UTV GARY REED notified Captain Cooper and advised that the STOLT INNOVATION had broken up its tow and that one of its barges was cast adrift and heading for the GENIUS STAR VII.

8. Captain Cooper observed one of the GARY REED barges drifting across the channel in the direction of her vessel.
9. She immediately issued helm orders to keep the GENIUS STAR VII on the green side of the channel to maximize the distance the barge would have to drift to make contact and began sounding the danger signal.
10. Unfortunately, after collision avoidance maneuvers made by Captain Cooper, the barge collided with the GENIUS STAR VII at its side shell plate port side amidships above the water line.
11. Captain Cooper immediately called the GARY REED to confirm there were no injuries and notified VTS of the situation.
12. Captain Cooper continued outbound transit to the outer anchorage without further incident and departed vessel for chemical testing (negative results).
13. GENIUS STAR VII suffered port side shell damage amidships above the waterline.
14. Damage to the barge was minimal.
15. There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Exhibit C
Incident Summary

Title: M/V SUMMER WIND collision with the Kirby barge 27706 being pushed by towing vessel MISS SUSAN March 22, 2014, IVO HSC Lt. 25/26.

Summary of Investigation:

U.S. Coast Guard Marine Safety Unit (“MSU”) Texas City opened a joint marine casualty investigation with the National Transportation Safety Board (“NTSB”) into this matter.

The Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee (“PBIRC”) was designated a party in interest as defined in 46 United States Code (USC) § 6303 and Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 4.03-10.

The PBIRC was designated a party to the NTSB safety investigation complying with the provisions of 49 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 831.11 and §831.13.

U.S. Coast Guard District Eight opened a Formal Investigation as lead investigator and held a public hearing for the Formal Investigation at Galveston County Criminal Justice Center.

The PBIRC Compliance Coordinator attended the public hearing, NTSB safety investigation, marine casualty site assessment, and witness interviews.

The following information was gathered by the PBIRC Compliance Coordinator from U. S. Coast Guard records, witness statements and interviews.

Summary of Facts:

1. At 11:55, March 22, 2014, Houston Branch Pilot Captain Michael Pizzitola boarded the M/V SUMMER WIND at Bolivar Roads Anchorage B for inbound transit to Cargill 1.
2. After master pilot exchange, vessel and crew were ready for intended transit.
3. Area conditions were reduced visibility with a flood tide and current of 0.6 kts.
4. At 12:10, anchor heaved Captain Pizzitola broadcast via VHF Ch 13 – “ship coming out of anchorage heading inbound for Houston”.
5. At 12:17, MISS SUSAN strung out with two tows broadcast via VHF Ch 13 – “coming down on the end of the dike bound for Bolivar”.
6. At 12:21, MISS SUSAN broadcast – “coming out of Texas City bound for Bolivar”.
7. At 12:22, Captain Pizzitola broadcast – “inbound ship going to Houston at buoy 16”.

8. At 12:25, Captain Pizzitola made a two whistle passing arrangement with two outbound tows operating in vicinity of HSC Lt 31/32, the MISSION and NATURES WAY COMMANDER.
9. AT 12:31, MISS SUSAN contacted SUMMER WIND. SUMMER WIND responded – “inbound ship approaching 25/26”.
10. MISS SUSAN asked – “I’m looking at everything fixing to start across the intersection bound for Bolivar, how do I look to you on your plotter”?
11. Captain Pizzitola replied – “well if you keep on going I’m gona get you unless you’re doing about 7 or 8 kts. Because right now I’m less than three quarters of a mile from you and you ain’t got to the channel yet”.
12. MISS SUSAN replied – “alright well shit I’m glad I called you here - alright we’ll try to see you on the one unless you want to a cut em back a little bit”.
13. Captain Pizzitola replied – “Captain I could cut her back I could put her on dead slow but that still ain’t gona stop her because I’m almost coming up on a half a mile on you”.
14. MISS SUSAN replied – “I’ll give her a hard rudder and we’ll see you on one ok”.
15. Captain Pizzitola replied – “one whistle thank you”.
16. At 12:33, MISS SUSAN broadcast – “I got a hard starboard rudder on her now”.
17. At 12:33, Captain Pizzitola replied – “you might want to stop and back it Cap I don’t know what to tell you cause man its close”.
18. MISS SUSAN replied – “roger on that I’m looking at these tows too alright we’re backing her down”.
19. At 12:34, Captain Pizzitola asked – “still got her backing full MISSION I’m sorry MISS SUSAN”?
20. MISS SUSAN answered – “roger on that roger on that I’m backing her hard Captain”.
21. Captain Pizzitola replied – “keep on doing it skipper keep on doing it – how many loads you got”?
22. MISS SUSAN answered – “two loads two loads I’m looking at you now and it don’t look good”.

23. Captain Pizzitola replied – “yeah it don’t look good you need to keep on backing it down as hard as you can I’m gona shoot her for the red side as much as I can just keep her going”.
24. Captain Pizzitola broadcast to the MISSION – “I’m coming over by you Captain”.
25. At 12:35, SUMMER WIND collided with MISS SUSAN lead Kirby barge 27706 amidships starboard above the waterline.
26. Captain Pizzitola turned the SUMMER WIND around and returned back to Bolivar Anchorage without further incident then departed the vessel for chemical testing (negative results).
27. MISS SUSAN disembarked two crew members complaining of inhalation problems soon after the collision.
28. There were no reported injuries on board the SUMMER WIND.
29. The barge suffered a gash to its starboard tank and discharged 168,000 gallons of fuel oil.
30. The SUMMER WIND sustained a hole to its bulbous and discharged ballast water.

Exhibit D
Incident Summary

Title: M/V BEKS CENK allision with 6-10 Bridge HSC May 13, 2014.

Summary of Investigation:

U.S. Coast Guard Sector Houston-Galveston opened a marine casualty investigation into this matter.

The Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee (“PBIRC”) requested to be designated party in interest party as defined in 46 United States Code (USC) § 6303 and Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) § 4.03-10 for this investigation but received no response.

The PBIRC Compliance Coordinator attended marine casualty site assessment, and witness interviews.

The following information was gathered by the PBIRC Compliance Coordinator from U.S. Coast Guard records, marine casualty site assessment, witness statements and interviews.

Summary of Facts:

1. May 13, 2014, Houston Branch Pilot Captain Sean Arbogast boarded the M/V BEKS CENK for inbound transit to Houston Turning Basin.
2. As the BEKS CENK approached 6-10 Bridge the upper mast allided with the bridge structure causing the mast to bend and lay aft.
3. The BEKS CENK completed passage underneath the bridge without further damage to its mast or bridge structure and moored at Turning Basin City Dock 8 without further incident.
4. Captain Arbogast notified VTS and Port Authority of the situation and departed vessel for chemical testing (negative results).
5. There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Exhibit E

Statement of Capt. Arthur Tuttle

My name is Arthur Tuttle. On May 22, 2014, I was the Houston Pilot dispatched to take the CHIPOLBROK GALEX from sea to City Dock 17. I engaged in a Master-Pilot conference during which the Captain indicated his ship and crew were ready to proceed with the intended transit, which was uneventful. As I reached the upper reaches of the Houston Ship Channel above Sydney Sherman Bridge, I proceeded on dead slow and used my harbor tug, MATTHEW K, made up on my starboard bow and working astern to further reduce my speed in anticipation of coming into the upper turning basin to turn the ship and come back and dock at City Dock 17 portside-to.

The ship MARITIME ROSEMARY was moored portside-to at Westway Terminal 2. I did not notice anything out of the ordinary as I approached the MARITIME ROSEMARY or up until the time that I was abeam of her. As my stern passed her bow, however, I observed the bow of the MARITIME ROSEMARY surge away from the berth and toward the stern of my ship. I proceeded into the turning basin, turned the CHIPOLBROK GALAXY, and came back to City Dock 17 where we docked without further incident. Once my ship was safely alongside, I looked over at Westway Terminal No. 2 and knew that the MARITIME ROSEMARY was aware of the issues with its lines because I observed linemen going to assist the ship.

After departing my ship, I reviewed the transit on my PPU and observed the MARITIME ROSEMARY surge towards the CHIPOLBROK GALAXY. The playback indicates that the CHIPOLBROK GALAXY was slowing as it passed the MARITIME ROSEMARY, from 5kts when the CHIPOLBROK GALAXY's bow passed the MARITIME ROSEMARY's stern to 3.5kts when the bow of the MARITIME ROSEMARY's bow surged toward the CHIPOLBROK GALAXY. The CHIPOLBROK GALAXY also passed 6-8 other moored ships in the upper reaches above the Sydney Sherman Bridge without any incident whatsoever.

Date

1 July '14

Capt. Art Tuttle

